DUBLIN 3.0: REINFORCING THE ‘UNCOMMON’ EUROPEAN ASYLUM SYSTEM?

The newly adopted EU Regulation in the light of the Syrian Refugee Crisis

Sarra Halima Saïda Zarrati-Seghiri
Supervisors: Professor Stelios Perrakis & Ass. Professor Daniella Marouda
Abstract

In the light of the current Syrian refugee crisis, this thesis analyses the impact of Dublin III, real cornerstone of the Common European Asylum System, on both European Union Member States with external borders and on the level of protection offered to Syrians.

Notwithstanding the recast of Dublin II was eagerly awaited by Member States for the determination of only one single member state responsible for the examination of a third country national application, the controversial criteria of irregular crossing of borders was reintroduced in Dublin III.

This research argues that without legal routes opened to asylum seekers, although legally recognising the right to asylum, in practice the EU and its Member States ‘encourage’ refugees to undertake dangerous routes to reach EU territory. In spite of their international obligations, relying on a more general EU external asylum policy, EU Member States seem to turn a blind eye on the fate of asylum seekers trying to reach European Union’ territory.

Finally my work argues that the Syrian refugee crisis does not represent a ‘new’ insurmountable challenge for the EU, besides the EU has got now all ‘instruments’ to face a refugee crisis except the political willingness to resort to them. Hence, my conclusion is that ‘uncommon’ asylum policies vis-à-vis Syrians ultimately continue to affect the principle of solidarity between EU Member States, despite the declared aim to harmonise their policies.
# Table of Contents

ABSTRACT 3

INTRODUCTION 8

PART 1: DUBLIN III: OLD WINE IN A NEW BOTTLE? 13

Chapter 1: Is there a right to asylum in Europe? 13
  Section 1: The international ‘asylum’ framework 13
    I. Traditional right to seek asylum 13
    II. An implicit right to asylum 15
  Section 2: The European reading of ‘asylum’ 16
    I. The European Convention on Human Rights and asylum (ECHR) 16
    II. The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU (CFREU) and the right to asylum 17

Chapter 2: Dublin II and its human rights implications: the ‘break away’ process among EUMS 21
  Section 1: Dublin II: asylum in the general scope of immigration policy 21
  Section 2: The impact of Strasbourg and Luxembourg on Dublin II: ‘mutual trust’ is over 23
    I. The progressive incorporation of Dublin II into the case law of the ECtHR 24
    II. The relationship between the ECtHR and the CJEU on Dublin II 25

Chapter 3: Recasting Dublin: Dublin III a close human rights system? 28
  Section 1: Reforming Dublin II: the inter-institutional road 28
    I. The proposal of the European Commission 28
    II. The Council and the European Parliament negotiations 30
  Section 2: Dublin III: tensions between rights of asylum seekers and member states’ prerogatives 30
    I. A right-based approach 31
    II. Repetition of the same flaws 32

PART 2: TRIANGULAR CASE STUDY: GREECE, BULGARIA AND TURKEY UNDER DUBLIN III: A HARMFUL COMBINATION FOR SYRIAN REFUGEES 34

Chapter 1: Greece and Bulgaria, fragile asylum systems 34
  Section 1: Greece, the ‘black sheep’ of the Dublin system 34
    I. Pre-legislative reform 34
    II. Perspectives post-reform 37
  Section 2: Bulgaria, from ‘refugee producer country’ to host country for refugees: a foreseeable asylum’ failure 39
I. New gateway to the EU
II. Facing unpreparedness

Chapter 2: Circumvent Dublin: more control, less access to asylum for Syrians
Section 1: Greece and Bulgaria plans of restrictive access to their territories
I. The security approach
II. The measures of ‘containment’ of new arrivals

Section 2: Indiscriminate refoulement to Turkey: legal analysis of push-backs
I. Greek-Bulgarian practices of Push-backs
II. Push-backs vs. International-European-National obligations
   A. The norms involved
   1. Non-refoulement
   2. The prohibition of collective expulsions
      B. The extra-territorial character of push-backs
      1. International developments
      2. European extra-territoriality
III. Individual or collective responsibility through the EU?
   A. The jus cogens character of non-refoulement
   B. The accountability of the EU as institution

Chapter 3: The ‘convenient’ reference to ‘safe third country’ under Dublin III: is Turkey safe?
Section 1: The genesis of article 3(3)
I. The extraterritorial deflections of EU own responsibilities
II. ‘Safe third country’ a new lawful meaning
   A. The communitarisation of the concept
   B. The reinforced guarantees

Section 2: The Turkish asylum system: a precarious ‘generosity’ vis-à-vis Syrians refugees
I. The asylum guarantees from a transit country’ perspective.
   A. Turkey’ geographical limitation to the CRR
   B. The prospects of the new Law on Foreigners and International Protection
II. The ‘generous’ approach vis-à-vis Syrian Refugees
   A. A privileged status
   B. Limits to ‘generosity’
      1. The Temporary Protection framework
      2. The open-door policy
      3. To be registered or not to be in camps
      4. Future prospects

PART 3: PROSPECTS FOR SYRIAN REFUGEES IN EU: WHAT HAVE BEEN DONE AND WHAT CAN BE DONE?

Chapter 1: Towards the activation of the EU Temporary Protection
Section 1: Facing massive influx of displaced persons: the path towards EU harmonization

   A. The Bosnia’ refugee crisis: ‘uncommon’ EU’ response
   B. The Kosovo’ refugee crisis: testing the ‘burden sharing’ policy

II. The EU Temporary Protection (2001)
   A. The directive
   B. Its applicability to the Syrian refugee crisis

Section 2: The Syrians refugee crisis: a new test for the EU (2011- )

I. Facing a risk of massive arrivals: activation of article 33
II. Ad hoc solutions for Syrians Refugees in EUMS

Chapter 2: What’s next?

Section 1: The limits of shortage solutions
   I. Return
   II. Risk of ‘legal limbo’ for Syrians Refugees

Section 2: Urgent need for a comprehensive response at EU level
   I. Consequences of uncommon asylum policies vis-à-vis Syrian Refugees
   II. Towards new perspectives

CONCLUSION

BIBLIOGRAPHY

ANNEX I

ANNEX II

ANNEX III
Dublin 3.0: reinforcing the 'uncommon' European asylum system? : the newly adopted EU regulation in the light of the Syrian refugee crisis

Zarrati Seghiri, Sarra Halima Saïda

https://doi.org/20.500.11825/474
Downloaded from Open Knowledge Repository, Global Campus’ institutional repository