‘INVISIBLE VICTIMS?’: MALE RAPE AND OTHER FORMS OF SEXUAL VIOLENCE AGAINST MEN IN ARMED CONFLICT

FINAL THESIS
EUROPEAN MASTER’S DEGREE IN HUMAN RIGHTS AND DEMOCRATISATION

Student
Ellen Anna Philo Gorris

Second Semester University
Eötvös Loránd University (ELTE), Budapest
E.MA National Director: Dr. Orsolya Salat (ELTE)

Supervisors
Central European University (CEU)
Prof. Dr. Karoly Bard (Chair Human Rights Program, CEU)
Prof. Dr. Andrea Peto (Gender Studies Department, CEU)

Date of Submission
12 July 2013
ABSTRACT

In this thesis the author has explored relevant legal and human security frameworks specifically covering wartime sexual violence to assess the position, protection or visibility of the relatively ‘silent’ victim group of male victims. It was found that in the current instruments, the visible victims are ‘women and girls’. They are often included explicitly in legal and policy provisions, thereby seemingly excluding male victims. However, many reports substantiate significant male victimization of wartime sexual violence. The apparent female-focused approach has programmatic implications for male victims, who are under-recognized and under-protected. The instruments in place follow traditional gender roles, where men are conceptualized as aggressive perpetrators and women as non-violent victims, being traditional notions of hegemonic masculinity and heterosexuality. The existing serious dichotomy between visible and invisible victims is prominently based on their ‘gender identity’ and leads to structural discrimination of, for instance, male victims of rape or other forms of sexual violence. To overcome this situation and develop more inclusive instruments, it is advised to reconceptualise the meaning and use of words like ‘gender’, ‘gender perspective’ and ‘gender dimension’. Additionally, a more intersectional approach to sexual violence should be adopted, understanding that victims have a multitude of identities such as ethnicity or religious affiliation that make them particularly vulnerable to suffering.

Thesis Information

Word Count 29,898 words

Please note that the word count excludes: Abstract, Acknowledgments, Table of Contents and Bibliography. It only includes Chapters 1 – 8 and the footnotes therein.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This thesis was inspired by a short essay written in the fall semester of the European Master’s Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation (E.Ma) at the European Inter-University Centre in Venice, Italy. The purpose of that paper was to critically assess the implementation of United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 (2000), which started the discourse Women, Peace and Security and brought women’s issues during and after war high on the international human security agenda. During my research, I came across news articles on sexual violence in conflict directed against men. To that point, I was only aware of female victims of wartime sexual violence, having previously written an LL.M. thesis on United Nations Peacekeepers individual criminal responsibility for sexual abuse, focussing on human trafficking. Reading Resolution 1325, I realised that male victims fell out of the scope of its protection seemed to be an invisible victim group. This is what led me to draft a research proposal on male victims of wartime sexual violence. As the E.MA program is multidisciplinary and I have an exclusively legal background, it seemed educational for me to compile a critical perspective on the issue of male victimization from other relevant disciplines, especially gender studies.

For the development of this thesis, I would like to thank the E.Ma team in Venice for the wonderful first semester and discussions leading up to the submitted research proposal. In particular, I am thankful to John Reynolds, for the first discussions on my topic, Monika Bartoszewicz, for her confidence in me, and Angela Melchiorre, for advising me but also for her tireless dedication to the E.Ma program, ensuring the well being of all students. I also would like to thank Dr. Orsolya Salat, our E.MA National Director, who always kept a careful eye out for the E.MA students in Budapest, and who was always up for a nice discussion on our topics, or the current democratic situation in Hungary.

Moreover, I wrote this thesis under careful supervision of two lecturers at the Central European University in Budapest, to whom I am very grateful for taking the time to meet with me, discuss my views and give me ample guidance. I want to thank Professor Karoly Bard of the Human Rights department for our fruitful discussions and his comments on especially the legal part of this thesis. My thanks are also due to Professor Andrea Peto of the Gender Studies Department for her patience with me (as a lawyer) and for introducing me to the ‘gender lens’ on the issue,
projected by the many different debates within feminism and sociology. This co-supervision from two disciplinary angles was a unique opportunity for me, as it provided interesting insights from both sides, making my thesis come to live through debates in their offices. From both I have learnt tremendously, like I have from researching and writing this thesis. As a lawyer, I care about categorization and systems that clarify who is to be protected or prosecuted for what. Writing this thesis has however taught me the danger of not being critical about what (system or categorization) is in place, because this may foster an attitude of complacency with what we have rather than one of continuously improvement. This is what I experienced in this thesis regarding the dichotomy between visible/invisible victims and ‘rights holders’.

Lastly, I would also like to thank my family and friends, in Venice and in Budapest, for a wonderful year, and for providing me with new perspectives, adventures and friends. In particular, I want to thank Edith, for being a wonderful roommate and friend in the first semester, Alasdair, for editing advice, Joana, for the many discussions on my topic, always providing me with new ideas, and my mother, for all the moral support. Lastly, special thanks go to my father, for always being available, no matter what time-zone he is in or how full his agenda is, and Fabien, for providing me with care, laughter, confidence, love, and the sometimes necessary distraction during the writing process.

Ellen Anna Philo Gorris

12 July 2013
# ABBREVIATIONS

In this thesis some of the following abbreviations shall frequently be used.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAT</td>
<td>Convention Against Torture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDAW</td>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEVAW</td>
<td>Declaration Against Violence Against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Democratic Republic of the Congo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECHR</td>
<td>European Court of Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBV</td>
<td>Gender-Based Violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAC</td>
<td>International Armed Conflict</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IACHR</td>
<td>Inter-American Court of Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCPR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICJ</td>
<td>International Court of Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTY</td>
<td>International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTR</td>
<td>International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>International Criminal Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIAC</td>
<td>Non-International Armed Conflict</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCSL</td>
<td>Special Court for Sierra Leone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SGBV</td>
<td>Sexual and Gender-Based Violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNGA</td>
<td>United Nations General Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNSC</td>
<td>United Nations Security Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNSG</td>
<td>United Nations Secretary-General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WPS</td>
<td>Women, Peace and Security (Resolution 1325 discourse)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ............................................................................................................................... 2

THESIS INFORMATION ........................................................................................................... 2

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ............................................................................................................. 3

ABBREVIATIONS ...................................................................................................................... 5

1. INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................. 9

2. TERMINOLOGY .................................................................................................................... 15
   2.1. INTERNATIONAL LAW AND HUMAN SECURITY DISCOURSE .................................... 15
   2.2. SEXUAL VIOLENCE ........................................................................................................ 15
   2.3. ARMED CONFLICT ........................................................................................................ 17
   2.4. 'SEX' AND 'GENDER' .................................................................................................. 17

3. CONFLICT-RELATED SEXUAL VIOLENCE AGAINST MEN ........................................... 19
   3.1. INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................ 19
   3.2. GATHERING FACTS AND DATA .................................................................................. 20
   3.3. REPORTING ON WARTIME SEXUAL VIOLENCE ........................................................ 21
       3.3.1. Annual Report of the Secretary-General to the Security Council .............................. 21
       3.3.2. International Criminal Tribunals ........................................................................... 23
       3.3.3. Other Studies (non-UN sources) ........................................................................... 23
   3.4. FORMS AND TYPES OF SEXUAL VIOLENCE AGAINST MEN .................................. 25
       3.4.1. Male Rape and Forced Sexual Acts ....................................................................... 25
       3.4.2. Other Forms of Sexual Violence ........................................................................... 25
   3.5. REPORTED CONSEQUENCES OF SEXUAL VIOLENCE FOR MEN .............................. 26
   3.6. THEORIES ON PREVALENCE OF SEXUAL VIOLENCE IN SCHOLARLY LITERATURE ....... 27
   3.7. CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................... 31

4. LEGAL INSTRUMENTS ON SEXUAL VIOLENCE IN CONFLICT ...................................... 32
   4.1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................ 32
   4.2. INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW ..................................................................... 32
       4.2.1. Freedom from Torture and Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment ...................... 33
       4.2.2. Gender-Based Violence ......................................................................................... 36
   4.3. INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW (IHL) ............................................................ 39
       4.3.1. Laws on Sexual Violence ....................................................................................... 39
       4.3.2. Inclusive Terminology .......................................................................................... 40
   4.4. INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW (ICL) ..................................................................... 41
       4.4.1. Integration of Sexual Violence in International Criminal Law ................................ 41
       4.4.2. Akayesu Case at the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda ........................... 42
       4.4.3. Furundzija Case-Law at the ICTY ......................................................................... 42
       4.4.4. Definition at the International Criminal Court .......................................................... 43
       4.4.5. Rape as Torture under International Criminal Law ............................................... 44
       4.4.6. Other Remaining Challenges ................................................................................. 45
   4.5. CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................... 47
5. POLICY FRAMEWORK ON SEXUAL VIOLENCE: WOMEN, PEACE AND SECURITY ..... 50

5.1. INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 50
5.2. RESOLUTION 1325 (2000) .................................................................................................. 51
  5.2.1. Resolution 1325 On Sexual Violence in Conflict ..................................................... 52
  5.2.2. Critical Evaluation of Resolution 1325 ...................................................................... 53
  5.2.3. Actors of Change Explain Criticism ............................................................................ 55
5.3. RESOLUTION 1820 (2008) .................................................................................................. 57
  5.3.1. Focus is on ‘Women and Girls’ .................................................................................. 57
5.5. UN ACTION AND STOP RAPe NOr! ................................................................................ 61
5.6. REPORTING BY THE SECRETARY-GENERAL: EMERGING ISSUE ......................... 62
5.7. CONCLUSION ..................................................................................................................... 63

6. IMPLICATIONS OF LEGAL AND POLICY FRAMEWORK ON SEXUAL VIOLENCE ...... 64

6.1. INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 64
6.2. PRACTICAL IMPLICATIONS .............................................................................................. 64
  6.2.1. Programmatic and Reporting Consequences for Victims/Survivors ......................... 64
  6.2.2. Under Human Rights Law, Men Seen As Torture Victims ........................................ 66
6.3. THEORETICAL IMPLICATIONS ....................................................................................... 67
  6.3.1. Visible and Invisible Victims ..................................................................................... 67
  6.3.2. The “Marked Body” .................................................................................................... 71
  6.3.3. Gender Roles and Masculinities ................................................................................ 74
  6.3.4. Limited Understanding of Human Security Dimensions ........................................ 79
  6.3.5. ‘Gender’, ‘Gender Dimension’, ‘Gender Perspective’, and ‘Gender Mainstreaming’ –
        What does it mean? ........................................................................................................... 79

7. RECOMMENDATIONS .......................................................................................................... 82

7.1. INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 82
7.2. LEGAL AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS ................................................................. 82
  7.2.1. Definition Sexual Violence in Women, Peace and Security ...................................... 82
  7.2.2. Increased Awareness, Support, Training, and Research .......................................... 83
  7.2.3. Increased Awareness of Gender-Based Violence .................................................... 85
7.3. THEORETICAL RECOMMENDATION I: THEORIZING ‘GENDER’ ................................. 85
7.4. THEORETICAL RECOMMENDATION I: INTERSECTIONALITY THEORY ...................... 90

8. CONCLUSION ....................................................................................................................... 95

9. BIBLIOGRAPHY .................................................................................................................... 102

9.1. LEGAL SOURCES ............................................................................................................. 102
  9.1.1. International Human Rights Law .............................................................................. 102
  9.1.2. International Humanitarian Law .............................................................................. 102
  9.1.3. International Criminal Law ...................................................................................... 103
9.2. CASE-LAW ....................................................................................................................... 104
  9.2.1. International Court of Justice ................................................................................... 104
  9.2.2. International Criminal Tribunals ............................................................................. 104
  • PROSECUTOR v TADIC, JUDGMENT, ICTY-94-1, 26 JANUARY 2000 ......................... 104
  9.2.3. Regional Human Rights Courts .............................................................................. 105
  9.2.4. International Human Rights Monitoring/Treaty Bodies ........................................ 105
9.3. UNITED NATIONS DOCUMENTS ..................................................................................... 105
"Invisible victims?": male rape and other forms of sexual violence against men in armed conflict

Gorris, Ellen Anna Philo

https://doi.org/20.500.11825/572

Downloaded from Open Knowledge Repository, Global Campus’ institutional repository